Polygamy Mentoring in Indonesia: Al-Qur’an, Hadith and Dominant Discourse Resistance

Miski
Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrabim, Malang, Indonesia.
miski@uin-malang.ac.id

Mila Aulia
Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta, Indonesia.
miaumilaaulia@gmail.com

Roudlotul Jannah
Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta, Indonesia.
roudlotuljannah0707@gmail.com

Ridya Nur Laily
Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta, Indonesia.
ridya.lidy2403@gmail.com

Abstract
This article intends to examine the phenomenon of polygamy mentoring in Indonesia, which is campaigned by Kiai Hafidin on the Robbanian Family Youtube account. This study focuses on how the interpretation of polygamy according to Kiai Hafidin, its correlation with polygamy that developed in Indonesia, and the religious problems in this country. The approach used is a virtual ethnographic approach (netnography) by applying two analytical models, discourse analysis and hermeneutical analysis. This research shows that the polygamy discourse delivered by Kiai Hafidin is allegedly based on the theological reasoning of QS. al-Nisa’ (4): 3 and 129, and the practice of polygamy by the Prophet Muhammad and his companions, but tends to be apologetic. Moreover, Kiai Hafidin’s polygamy discourse is positioned as resistance to the existing discourse in Indonesia, namely monogamy discourse. For Kiai Hafidin, polygamy is related to marriage and as an alternative to various socio-religious problems; for example, as a solution to the rise of adultery cases, many women are still single, and the depletion of religiously good women. However, apart from this, Kiai Hafidin’s polygamy discourse basically strengthens the interests of patriarchy, which further distances the ideal bond between men and women.

Keywords: Polygamy Mentoring, Hadith, Hermeneutics, Resistance, Patriarchy.
praktik poligami yang dilakukan oleh Nabi Muhammad dan para sahabat, namun cenderung apologetik. Lebih dari itu, diskursus poligami ala Kiai Hafidin diposisikan sebagai resistansi terhadap diskursus yang selama ini eksis di Indonesia, yaitu diskursus monogami. Bagi Kiai Hafidin, poligami tidak sekedar hubungannya dengan pernikahan, tetapi juga sebagai alternatif dari berbagai problem sosial-keagamaan, misalnya sebagai solusi maraknya kasus perzinaan, banyak wanita yang masih lajang, dan menipisnya perempuan yang baik secara agama. Namun, terlepas dari hal tersebut diskursus poligami ala Kiai Hafidin pada dasarnya semakin menguatkan kepentingan patriarki yang justru semakin menjauhkan ikatan yang ideal antara laki-laki dan perempuan.

Kata Kunci: Mentoring Poligami, Hadis, Hermeneutika, Resistansi, Patriarki.

INTRODUCTION
In Indonesia’s incessantly monogamous marriage discourse, Kiai Hafidin came up with an open polygamy campaign. This polygamy campaign is found massively in various programs broadcast live on various online media channels. The spread of the values of the Qur’ān and hadith has become a trend on various social media. In this case, Kiai Hafidin is in a position as a mentor, coach, or trainer for various seminars on polygamy, both on a local and national scale. Related to this, several figures from well-known institutions gave negative responses. Puspitarini, Chairperson of Nasyiatul Aisyiyah, explained that the polygamy campaign could negatively affect social conditions in Indonesia. Likewise, Siti Aminah Tardi, Commissioner of the National Commission for Women, noted the need to review polygamy mentoring activities. For him, these activities only provide an image of profit for men by ignoring other facts of violence and divorce that arise because of polygamy. However, the rampant polygamy campaign seems to have been neglected in scientific-academic discourse. So far, studies related to the issue of polygamy have only revolved around three main trends. First is a study that seeks to reinterpret the verses of the Qur’ān and hadith about polygamy according to contemporary values. In this reinterpretation, several approaches are used; hermeneutic, maqashidi, and socio-historical.

2 Narasi, Mushaq Sii Lain Mentoring Poligami Berbayar (YouTube, 2021).
approaches that are connected to the early Islamic period. Second, a study that focuses on the thoughts of Muslim figures, both classical and contemporary, about polygamy-monogamy. In this case, Fazlurrahman, Amina Wadud, Riffat Hasan, and Quraish Shihab became the objects of study. Their thoughts about polygamy-monogamy are always associated with progressive and responsive thoughts to the times. Third, a special study on polygamy that occurs in the general public is practiced by religious leaders. Several approaches are used in this type of study, among others, hermeneutics, sociology, economics, etc.

Based on the significance of this issue, this study is intended to make a scientific-academic contribution. However, Khoi Hafidin’s polygamy mentoring has become a social phenomenon with real implications. In several polygamy mentoring events spread across various social media, this event is of great interest to many audiences; some give testimonials and satisfaction. In other words, the study of this phenomenon is no longer limited to theoretical studies. However, although this study is empirical-phenomenological, in reality, it is not like the study of polygamous practices that exist in social space and tend to be passive. In this context, Khoi Hafidin is not only a mentor, coach, and trainer who then creates a counter-discourse in the marriage bond, which tends only to emphasize the monogamous aspect. He also practices polygamy and makes it a role model for polygamy in Indonesia. Thus, this study can fill in the gaps of other studies.


There are three questions posed in this study. First, how are the Qur’an and hadith about polygamy interpreted to form a distinctive discourse in the hands of Kiai Hafidin? This question departs from the assumption that the practice and discourse of Kiai Hafidin’s polygamy cannot be separated from the process of interpreting the two main sources of Islam: the Qur’an and hadith. These two main sources are used as the theological basis for the various mentoring activities carried out by Kiai Hafidin, especially in his capacity as a religious figure. Second, how is the correlation of Kiai Hafidin’s polygamous discourse based on the Qur’an and hadith correlated with the discourse that has developed in Indonesia? In this case, it is recognized that there is not a single discourse that is separated from context. Third, how does Kiai Hafidin position the discourse on polygamy in the religious problems that exist in Indonesia? This question is correlated with the fact that the birth of discourse has a purpose. Concerning the issue of polygamy, the main assumption is the relationship between men and women in a marriage. Still, as an inseparable part of the social context, this discourse cannot be separated from other matters outside of marriage. These three questions assume that the phenomenon of mentoring polygamy never appears in a vacuum; Kiai Hafidin, who is free to provide legal and open mentoring on polygamy and demonstrates the “success” of polygamy, shows a shift in the sacredness of marriage and so on.

This study is a virtual ethnographic study (netnography). The study focused on non-real or virtual objects. The author participates as a passive audience which focuses on the presentations of Kiai Hafidin during polygamy mentoring. In this case, the intended impressions are those contained in the Robbanian Family account. This account officially broadcasts Kiai Hafidin’s lectures during polygamy mentoring, starting from May 2020 to January 2022. Kiai Hafidin’s presentations in this account also serve as primary data for the author’s study, while other information is contained in this account. Scientific articles, newspapers, social media accounts, books, etc., are the secondary data. Thus, overall, the main data in this study were obtained using the documentation method. The panelists did not use the interview method because Kiai Hafidin’s presentations were in podcasts/dialogues/discussions between Kiai Hafidin and the hosts. The system itself represents the author’s various questions, so there is no need for an independent interview.

The data obtained through the above method were analyzed using the discourse analysis method. In this case, there were two analytical models applied. The first was discourse content analysis. This analysis was applied to find concretely how Kiai Hafidin used the Qur’an and hadith as guidelines in marketing discourses on polygamy. The second is a hermeneutical analysis. It analyses how the model is used as a form of resistance to reality that, according to Kiai Hafidin, it needs to be ‘resisted’. Besides, the discourse used as an alternative in socio-religious issues is also analyzed. This analysis required an interpretation of the data collected based on indicators that were considered relevant, both internal and external. From this interpretation, it could be concluded that Hafidin’s polygamy discourse could not be separated from today’s context, including the contestation between different discourses.
DISCUSSION

Polygamy in Indonesia: The Text of the Qur’an and Hadith, the Context, and the Contestation

Polygamy Phenomenon in Indonesia

Polygamy is a social polemic that is always interesting to discuss and debate at all levels of the world’s Muslim community, including Indonesia. In Indonesia, polygamy is not new or foreign to hear and even do. This practice, which is often used in the name of religion, has been widely practiced in various circles of Indonesian society, especially among the owners of money and power or who are often known as the ‘elite’; political, officials, businessmen, and religious leaders. It is carried out with a serial marriage model or an official marriage and is registered with the Religious Affairs Office. The majority of polygamous practices that often occur tend to be motivated by several factors. Such as biological factors, such as the emergence of liking and love for other women after marriage, and theological factors (texts of the Qur’an and hadith), which are often the main basis, especially among religious leaders, in legitimizing the practice of polygamy. In addition, stability in economic factors is also one of the triggers for the emergence of the desire to implement polygamy.

In the context of positive law in Indonesia, marriage for Muslims in Indonesia adheres to the principle of monogamy; namely, a man marries one woman. It has been stipulated in Law Number 1 of 1974, article 3 point (1). However, in Law Number 1 of 1974, article 3 point (2), Indonesian law opens up opportunities for men to marry more than one woman (polygamy). In addition, Indonesian law also stipulates conditions for polygamous actors, as stated in Law no. 1 of 1974 Chapter 1 Basic Marriage Article 3 point 2, article 4, and article 5. However, in reality, there are deviations made by polygamous actors against the provisions set by the state, such as not applying for a polygamy permit to the religious court so that it is not officially registered at the Religious Affairs Office. Based on Indonesian law, the practice of polygamy like this is illegal, although, in Islamic law, it is still legal.

The Qur’an and Hadith in the Construction of Polygamy in Indonesia

The rules of polygamy behavior set by Indonesian law are actually by the sources contained in the text of the Qur’an and the hadith adopted from some classical literature. The realized output is the legitimacy of the practice of polygamy in Indonesia with a maximum limit of

---

6 Sa’dan, “Poligami Atas Nama Agama: Studi Kasus Kiai Madura.”
8 Abror, “Poligami Dan Relevansinya Dengan Keharmonisan Rumah Tangga (Studi Kasus Di Kelurahan Rajabasa, Bandar Lampung).”
9 Sa’dan, “Poligami Atas Nama Agama: Studi Kasus Kiai Madura.”
10 Abror, “Poligami Dan Relevansinya Dengan Keharmonisan Rumah Tangga (Studi Kasus Di Kelurahan Rajabasa, Bandar Lampung).”
four wives.\textsuperscript{13} The requirements for legalizing polygamy in detail have also been stated in the provisions of the Compilation of Islamic Law, where the policies written in it are not contradictory to the spirit of Islamic religious texts, both from the Qur’an and hadith.\textsuperscript{14} Two main verses are used as arguments for polygamy, namely QS al-Nisa’ (4): 3 and QS al-Nisa’ (4): 129. Quraish Shihab underlined that QS al-Nisa’ (4): 3 does not create rules for polygamy because polygamy was practiced in society’s customs before this verse was revealed. This verse only talks about the permissibility of polygamy if it is necessary, with severe conditions, and is not a recommendation or obligation to practice polygamy. The verse of the QS al-Nisa’ (4): 129 shows the permissibility of polygamy even though absolute justice cannot be realized.\textsuperscript{15} This discourse has also been raised by many classical to contemporary commentators.

Suppose we draw on the real-life of Indonesia. In that case, there is often a misunderstanding among some Indonesian people in defining polygamy and understanding the Prophet’s traditions about polygamy so that the impact leads to inaccuracies in the execution of polygamy practices following the Qur’an and hadith. Whereas the implied indication of the Prophet’s hadith is that monogamous marriages are emphasized because the real purpose of marriage can be achieved. The condition of the people at that time did not allow the Prophet to be able to directly determine the law with certainty and firmness, especially on the issue of polygamy, which often escapes the understanding of the community.\textsuperscript{16} It is in line with the opinion of the prominent Indonesian feminist interpreter, Musdah Mulia, on the issue of polygamy that the permissibility of polygamy, which is seen from the arguments for polygamy, is only a temporary solution for Muslims in the early days. Even though polygamy is very contrary to the principle and purpose of marriage, no human being meets the fair criteria in polygamy except only the Prophet. The current practice of polygamy causes more chaos than benefits.\textsuperscript{17} So it can be concluded that the construction of polygamy practices in Indonesia, in general, is still not formed from a deep and comprehensive understanding.

**Implementation of Polygamy in the Elites of Indonesian Society**

The phenomenon of the practice of polygamy among religious elites (Kiai) in Indonesia cannot be separated from patriarchal culture.\textsuperscript{18} Polygamy that is practiced by religious elites is something that is considered normal by ordinary people. The clerical elite is deemed warasatul anbiya’ (successors of the Prophets), who are highly respected and obeyed.\textsuperscript{19} In everyday life, religious elites become role models and are always asked for consideration in

\begin{itemize}
  \item[14] Syamsuddin, “A Legal Debate on Polygamy: Classical and Contemporary Perspectives.”
  \item[16] Syahriza, “Analisis Teks Hadis Tentang Poligami Dan Implikasinya.”
  \item[17] Robikah, “Pergeseran Paradigm Tafsir Al-Quran: Analisis Terhadap Tafsir Feminis Di Indonesia.”
\end{itemize}
all problems. The community believes that the practice of polygamy carried out by religious elites follows Islamic teachings. It is because the clerical elite is considered to have more understanding of the teachings of Islam. So, if the clerical elite practice polygamy, it will not be a bad thing or become a problem in society. The community makes it an example and role model to practice in their lives. Thus, such an understanding cannot be separated from the patriarchal culture indoctrinated constantly to obey the clerical elite.

The practice of polygamy in the clerical elite is not carried out without the underlying factors. In practice, polygamy is practiced for several reasons; an outlet for the tradition of matchmaking in the family environment, a desire to have many children or offspring, a fulfillment of biological needs, and a reason to follow the Prophet. Apart from these factors, other factors are essential in the practice of polygamy by religious elites. The religious elite’s understanding of the texts of the Qur’an and Hadith is often interpreted visually or textually. It takes a set of tools to interpret texts, and social humanity, for example, so that when the text is faced with a social condition, it can live in every era. The law of fiqh that is used as the legitimacy of polygamy by the religious elite shows a closeness in interpreting the text, which will result in a rigid interpretation. The strength of society’s patriarchal culture makes the hierarchy of power always in the hands of men. Thus, the practice of polygamy that occurs among religious elites is motivated by internal factors (personal understanding) and external factors as reasons that are often expressed for polygamy.

Kiai Hafidin: Profile of the Indonesian Polygamy Mentor

Robbanian Family is a Youtube account that talks about happy families. This can be seen from the description on the Robbanian Family account, namely “Menginstall Mindset Bahagia Menuju Keluarga Robbany”. However, in reality, the discussion of the videos uploaded to the Robbanian Family account mostly focuses on discussions about polygamy, which is also reinforced by major themes in each video, such as “Efek Buruk Kalau Masyarakat Tidak Poligami”, “Bahagianya Poligami”, and “Poligami Juga Syariat, Berislam Kok Tebang Pilih”, and one of the descriptions is “Poligami Learning Center”. As stated by the Robbanian Family account host, the discussion about happy families is only a small part. The number of videos uploaded to the Robbanian Family account totals 53, from May 16, 2020, to January 19, 2022. Besides focusing on Youtube accounts, Robbanian Family also has other social media accounts, namely Instagram and Facebook, with the same account name, ‘Robbanian Family’.

The high public interest in the Robbanian Family account can be seen from the number of subscribers, more than 1000 subscribers, and the number of viewers reaching 18,000. The Robbanian Family account also offers interesting themes about polygamy so that it invites public interest to visit the account, such as a discussion about “Layangan Putus

---

22 Sa’dan, “Poligami Atas Nama Agama: Studi Kasus Kiai Madura.”
23 Robbanian Family, “Poligami, Minta Izin Atau Minta Maaf?,” YouTube.
Polygamy in Kiai Hafidin’s Discourse Construction

Al-Qur’an and Hadith in Polygamy Mentoring Activities: Apologetic Reason

Often in QS al-Baqarah (2): 208, which reads “O you who believe! Come in full submission to Islam (kaffah)” as a patent reference for all aspects of someone who wants to be a perfect Muslim. This realization seems to be experienced by Kiai Hafidin as the ‘professor’ of polygamy, that polygamy is also an Islamic law that cannot be selective in practice. Kiai Hafidin analogized the obligations of polygamy to the obligation of a Muslim to perform prayers. The primary reason is that all the verses that humans learn in the world will be held accountable in the hereafter, including implementing polygamy. However, as the author observes, there is no specific hadith text about polygamy that Kiai Hafidin has put forward as the argument for the determination of polygamy. He seems to be limited to interpreting the hadith of the Prophet as an act. His statement shows that the Prophet Muhammad and the four caliphs were role models for polygamy. Hence, the application of polygamy by the people after that is part of the practice of sunnah. Even polygamy is considered a sunnah with the most barriers compared to other sunnah acts.


27 Narasi, Mengaku Sisi Lain Mentoring Poligami Berbayar.

28 Robbanian Family, “Poligami Juga Syariat, Berislam Kok Tebang Pilih,” YouTube.

Kiai Hafidin made a special video to respond to questions from Facebook and Instagram respondents regarding the meaning of fairness in polygamy, which was explicitly mentioned in QS al-Nisa’ (4): 3. In Ibn Kathir’s Interpretation, the words allā ta’dilu relate to Allah’s prohibition on the guardian of the orphan marrying his orphan if he cannot give a commensurate dowry considering that the orphan is a wealthy woman. Another prohibition context also applies to guardians of orphans who marry their orphans who are poor and less beautiful because it will affect wrongdoing actions because they don’t love the woman. So Allah commands men to marry women who are liked and attractive (thāba), a maximum of four people.28 According to Kiai Hafidin, thāba is the shari’ah standard in the form of a virgin and younger than the first wife.29 In addition, men who do not accept the offer of polygamy from Allah are considered arrogant because they do not take advantage of rukshah given. It is analogous to the context of lightning prayer for travelers.30 At the same time, the word allā ta’dilu is specifically for polygamous men with at least two wives. In other words, QS al-Nisa’ (4): 3 does not prevent a man from worrying about doing justice if he has not practiced polygamy with at least two wives.

Then with the QS al-Nisa’ (4): 129 as the second general argument about polygamy, Hafidin considers this verse to be a provision for polygamous practitioners and not to be used to attack polygamous people. This verse reflects the contradiction of polygamy, even though the Prophet and his companions, who were far more understanding than his people, had previously carried out polygamy. The reverse logic becomes that if it is known that the husband will never be able to treat his wives fairly, then the Prophet and his companions should not have practiced polygamy. Kiai Hafidin quoted Ibn Kathir’s opinion regarding the context of this verse so that men are not oppressed by their wives. So the requirement for polygamy for men is to have a good character and heart and good deeds. The rest of humans will not be able to do justice inwardly, and Allah already knows better about this.31 While outwardly acceptable forms can be in the form of living, for example, giving one hundred thousand to a wife, the same as giving four hundred thousand to four wives to apply justice in polygamy.32

**Polygamy Mentoring as a Dominant Discourse Resistance**

Polygamy mentoring is one of the efforts made or carried out by Kiai Hafidin as a religious figure and a polygamist practitioner who is considered successful in polygamy by some people. It is to overcome the rampant issues and problems related to polygamy and the overwhelming number of parties against polygamy. It starts from the arrival of several guests or clients who ask for directions and advice related to marriage, especially polygamy. However, the number of clients who visit increases daily, so it is necessary to hold polygamy trainers openly. It also does not escape the encouragement of their clients, who also think that many of the public need to know things related to polygamy, which they feel

---

29 Robbanian Family, “Memilih Calon Istri Untuk Poligami,” *YouTube.*
30 Robbanian Family, “3 Motivasi Utama Untuk Poligami,” *YouTube.*
31 Robbanian Family, “Benarkah Mustahil Adil Jika Berpoligami?,” *YouTube.*
32 Robbanian Family, “Poligami Bukan Soal Harta,” *YouTube.*
are trustworthy.\(^{33}\) So at first, polygamy mentoring was only carried out in the form of individuals or individuals. It succeeded in becoming a paid webinar that could be attended by all levels of society, both women and men.

In addition to his written work entitled \textit{45 Hari Sukses Poligami}, the polygamy mentoring carried out by Hafidin is also nothing but a form of resistance to the discourse that has dominated the community, namely monogamy, which is considered an ideal marriage model. When the opinion of the dominant scholars say that polygamy is permissible, Kiai Hafidin thinks that polygamy is a sunnah that gets a lot of obstacles from various parties; wife, family, and the local community. He said that people should be happy and grateful because there are groups who want to lift and practice the sunnah of the Prophet, who has many obstacles. QS. Al-Baqarah: 208 has ordered Muslims to convert to Islam \textit{kaffah} by accepting all the Shari’a, including polygamy, because polygamy is also a Shari’a that comes from Allah, so it is obligatory to study it. In addition, he also argues that happiness, glory, and glory will only be obtained by implementing Islam and all of its Shari’a in a \textit{kaffah} manner, including polygamy.\(^{34}\)

Kiai Hafidin, through his polygamy mentoring, also wants to explain to the community, especially women, that licensing for polygamy to the wife is not necessary because polygamy is a matter for the husband and God, not with the wife.\(^{35}\) In the family, a wife is under the leadership of her husband, so women are obliged to obey their husbands. Thus this is the definition of a \textit{ganiyat} woman. According to Kiai Hafidin, the quality and quantity of a wife’s happiness depend on her level of obedience and obedience to her husband. It is an absolute requirement to bring happiness from Allah.\(^{36}\) So that regardless of the husband’s behavior, even if it is a bad reaction, it should not affect the level of obedience of a wife to her husband and stay focused on giving the best to him. The main motive of the wife’s obedience to her husband is to get the reward and happiness from Allah SWT alone. Meanwhile, Hafidin argues that a wife’s question regarding the reason for choosing polygamous sharia from other laws is also a wife’s disobedience to her husband.

\textbf{Polygamy as an Alternative Solution to Socio-Religious Problems?}

Kiai Hafidin believes that polygamy is one of the Shari’a in Islam that must be adequately studied. A Muslim who is a true Muslim must be \textit{kaffah}, in the sense that he is not allowed to choose the Shari’a. Polygamy is also one of the alternative solutions to socio-religious problems that occur. Allah SWT guarantees that there must be a solution or answer to the problem for every problem. Thus, studying the Shari’a of polygamy correctly and adequately can solve some socio-religious problems. Kiai Hafidin expressed this opinion in his video podcast on Youtube, Robbanian Family. Kiai Hafidin said that if you want to be a true Islam, then a Muslim should not be picky about the Shari’a; Islam must be \textit{kaffah}, \textit{Udhulu fissilmi kaffah}. Because God guarantees all existing problems, there must be an

\(^{33}\) Narasi, \textit{Menguak Sisi Lain Mentoring Poligami Berbayar.}

\(^{34}\) Family, “Kenapa Harus Bahas Poligami, Emang Ga Ada Sunnah Lain?”; Family, “Poligami Juga Syariat, Berislam Kok Tebang Pilih.”

\(^{35}\) Robbanian Family, “Nasehat Untuk Suami Jika Ingin Berpoligami,” \textit{YouTube.}

\(^{36}\) Robbanian Family, “5 Pesan Untuk Muslimah Yang Ingin Dipoligami,” \textit{YouTube.}
answer. What about polygamy law? The status of the Shari’a in all religions is from Allah, including the Shari’a of polygamy.\(^37\) Thus, believing that polygamy is a law that brings benefit and happiness is one of the keys to success in the practice of polygamy. Therefore, it is impossible if Allah sent down a verse to afflict his people.

In reality, Kiai Hafidin said that many socio-religious problems could be overcome by practicing polygamy. Problems that often occur in the community include the prevalence of adultery. Kiai Hafidin said that, rather than someone committing adultery, it is better to practice polygamy, which is permitted by religion and even becomes one of the sunnah of the Prophet Muhammad SAW. The second is that many women do not have the opportunity to get married. The number of women, which is far more than the number of men, also requires men to marry more than one woman. It can save women who want to get married. A woman who has a husband who wants to remarry should allow it. The wife’s duty in the household is only to obey her husband.\(^38\) In fact, according to Kiai Hafidin, there is no obligation for a husband to ask permission from his first wife to remarry; in the household, a husband is a captain who is free to regulate, including polygamy.

The third is the weakening of concern in upholding Islamic law. As stated by Kiai Hafidin, that polygamy is one of the Islamic religious laws. Therefore, studying polygamy correctly and adequately can increase one’s concern for Islamic law. Polygamy also includes enforcing Islamic law. Fourth is due to the depletion of the number of pious women. Kiai Hafidin said that women obedient to their husbands are a form of pious women. A good husband is a husband who can educate his wife to be a pious woman. Thus, if a man has more than one, two, three, or even four wives, it can increase the number of pious women. Fifth is the spread of the love of the world for the people.\(^39\) Kiai Hafidin said that the most significant factor that women do not want to be polygamous is that women are afraid of losing their wealth. This kind of woman thinks that Kiai Hafidin intends to eliminate the love of wealth, including the love of the world, which, according to Kiai Hafidin, is evil and must be stopped. By providing polygamy mentoring, Kiai Hafidin tries to teach women that polygamy is not scary but brings happiness.

**Polygamy Mentoring in Indonesia and Strengthening Patriarchal Reason**

Based on the author’s explanation above, there is one main discourse from the Indonesian polygamy mentoring program initiated by Kiai Hafidin. In this context, the polygamy discourse delivered by Kiai Hafidin is allegedly based on theological reasons, namely QS. al-Nisa’ (4): 3 and 129 and the practice of polygamy by the Prophet Muhammad and his companions. Although the discourse offered tends to be apologetic in this context, nothing more than an argument to strengthen itself without rational reasoning. Kiai Hafidin’s explanation, in principle, is not just a discourse offered to the public but a form of resistance to the discourse that has existed and dominated in Indonesia. The discourse is that the ideal marriage is monogamous. For Kiai Hafidin, this pattern of thinking blames a

---

37 Family, “Poligami Juga Syariat, Berislam Kok Tebang Pilih.”
38 Robbanian Family, “Talk Show Bersama Istri 2;” YouTube.
39 Family, “Efek Buruk Kalau Masyarakat Tidak Berpoligami.”
shari’a contained in the Qur’an. Moreover, for Kiai Hafidin, polygamy is not only related to marriage. It is an alternative to various socio-religious problems solution, such as the prevalence of adultery, many women who do not have the opportunity to marry, and the depletion number of shalihah women.

In this case, the overall polygamy discourse presented by Kiai Hafidin is stuck in two problems, namely simplistic and ahistorical logic. A long history, polygamy has occurred since the time of the Prophet Muhammad. However, the Prophet Muhammad SAW practiced polygamy to help older women and widows practice. Over time, polygamy is not aimed at helping older women and widows but a biological need for men. Kiai Hafidin, which is practiced in his polygamy, explains that one must be younger and more beautiful in choosing a second, third and fourth wife. It is what causes the practice of polygamy in the Muslim community not to go well. Kiai Hafidin even said that currently, many movements want to eliminate the practice of polygamy, for example, the feminism movement. According to Kiai Hafidin, the feminist movement is also a barrier to the practice of polygamy as one of Islamic law and the sunnah of the Prophet Muhammad. Kiai Hafidin has a simplistic tendency to convey something from these several factors.

The simplistic logic raised by Kiai Hafidin in his polygamous mentoring program is basically motivated by his background or social status as a religious figure, mentor, and motivator. Therefore, Kiai Hafidin is interested in simplifying what he conveys so it is easier for the audience to digest. However, in this context, Kiai Hafidin is trapped in an untruth related to conveying something. One of them can be seen in Kiai Hafidin’s argument regarding the reasons behind the rejection of the feminist movement against polygamy. According to him, this rejection is caused by the desire of feminism to cover the potential for the increasing number of Muslims in the world without including a more specific explanation regarding the feminist movement with different views in the context of polygamy. As for Kiai Hafidin’s ahistorical attitude, it can be seen from his explanation of his polygamy mentoring program, which often does not give rise to the existence of polygamy and its purpose, which occurred at the time of the Prophet as a whole. It is due to Kiai Hafidin’s motive, which only uses arguments that can strengthen his argument regarding the grounding of polygamy.

Kiai Hafidin’s explanation regarding the verses on polygamy is basically different from that conveyed by contemporary interpreters or figures who have been considered authoritative in discussing this issue. Quraish Shihab does not recommend or require polygamy. It only allows it as a small emergency door with conditions that are not easy.\(^{40}\) In Syahrur’s view, there are three conditions for the permissibility of polygamy. First, the maximum number of wives that can be married (hadd al-a’la) is four people. Second, the second, third and fourth wives must be widowed women with orphans. Third, having a fear of not being able to do justice to orphans.\(^{41}\) In this case, Kiai Hafidin seemed to have only explained the permissibility of polygamy based on the experience of the Prophet and


his companions. He did not look further into the requirements for polygamy and was ignorant of historical conditions and contexts in the past. Although Kiai Hafidin described two ashab wurud by citing the narration contained in Ibn Kathir, the conclusion that polygamy was allowed that was raised did not have any elements of helping orphans or widows. Kiai Hafidin tends to generalize the women referred to in QS al-Nisa’ (4): 3 in the form of women who thāba or attract men in terms of beauty and age.

The concept of justice implicit in QS al-Nisa’ (4): 129, according to Amina Wadud is an attitude in making agreements, proper management of assets, fair treatment of female orphans, and fairness to wives. Justice is not only a matter of time and money but in a psychological aspect that refers to the heart and conscience. Because almost no man can be ‘fair’ as described, monogamous marriages are prioritized in Islam. In line with this, Fazlur Rahman’s spirit in interpreting the verse also has implications for monogamous marriages to minimize injustice that can lead to persecution. In contrast to Kiai Hafidin, although he admits that inner justice cannot be applied, polygamy is still a law because Allah is believed to absolutely know more about the condition of husbands who are not able to treat their wives with justice. It is also a form of simplification contained in Hafidin’s thoughts. It is also a form of simplification contained in Hafidin’s thoughts. Apart from this, Kiai Hafidin’s parameters for applying outward justice lie in the equality of the quantity of income provided, not in the different needs of each wife. Once again, in constructing the concept of justice in QS al-Nisa’ (4): 129, even Kiai Hafidin did not refer to justice in treating orphans.

Basically, the discourse related to polygamy so far, in the context of Indonesia, has always been directed at marriage which is monogamous. It is because monogamous marriage is the ideal marriage model. For example, from 2010 to 2020, studies on polygamy verses, namely QS an-Nisa’ (4): 3 and 129, are always associated with verses that support monogamy. It is different from the explanation given by Kiai Hafidin, who thinks that the two verses lead and support the implementation of polygamy sharia. For Kiai Hafidin, polygamy is an Islamic law that must be practiced as a form of taslim to Allah to avoid being arrogant towards Allah. In this context, Kiai Hafidin analogized polygamy with rukhsah in safar. In other words, monogamous marriage is the arrogant attitude of Muslims toward the offer of polygamy law that God has given and arranged in such a way. Other figures have emphasized that polygamy is not only related to the shari’a but is closely related and even leans more towards social understanding where the verses of the Qur’an were revealed.

The existence of exposure to polygamy in the Qur’an verses is nothing more than a response or a form of solution to the social phenomena that occurred at that time. It can

---

44 Machali, “Poligami Dalam Perdebatan Teks Dan Konteks: Melacak Jejak Argumentasi Poligami Dalam Teks Suci.”
45 Basyar, “Aspek Humanisme Poligami (Analisis Feminisme Terhadap Pemikiran Muhammad Shahrur Mengenai Syarat-Syarat Poligami).”
be seen from the contextual-historical point of view, which as a whole discusses widows and orphans who were left as martyrs (fallen in the battle of Uhud) by their husbands and fathers. Many experts agree that this verse explains the prohibition against abusing orphans and eating orphans’ property. No indication shows the obligation to command polygamy in QS an-Nisa’ (4): 3. In addition, looking at the history of the Prophet, precisely with the revelation of QS an-Nisa’ (4): 3, indicates that this verse is more inclined toward monogamous marriage. It can be seen from the limitation on the number of women allowed to be married to a man. At that time, the tradition that occurred allowed a man to have polygamy without limiting the number of women. However, with the revelation of this verse of the Qur’an, then polygamy was limited or limited to a certain number, namely only four women.

In this case, however, Kiai Hafidin’s explanation contradicts the findings of certain agencies. For example, the Alwasliyah Organization argues that polygamy can be done in an emergency. The Council for the Deliberation of Indonesian Women’s Islamic Organizations in Lampung Province also said that polygamy could be carried out because the first wife’s approval is also the local religious court. On the other hand, polygamy’s massiveness raises several social and religious problems, including other problems such as high divorce rates and high poverty rates. In psychology, it shows that one of the main factors influencing children’s social development is the factor of family integrity. Thus, the impact of polygamy on children can have a negative effect, including the lack of complete attention from the father and the lack of a leading role of the mother in providing the support system. Disobedience in the family will also impact children’s academic results, psychological problems, mental health, a trauma in dealing with households, and depression.

The reality in the previous explanation proves that Kiai Hafidin’s opinion regarding polygamy as an alternative solution to socio-religious problems is very contradictory. Kiai Hafidin’s presentation is different from the reality of the impact of polygamy practices in Indonesia. In this case, Kiai Hafidin seems to say that polygamy is a good way and even the only way to overcome socio-religious problems. Some Islamic groups or movements, such as feminism, say that the concept of polygamy is only one alternative concept and not the only one to deal with socio-religious problems. Kiai Hafidin seemed to ignore the moral ideal of the revelation of the polygamy verse, namely justice. Kiai Hafidin’s explanation only focused on polygamy as a law that must be enforced and polygamy as a sunnah of the Prophet that must be practiced. Thus, this also causes pros and cons in the community regarding the concept of polygamy practice.

46 Robiakah, “Pergeseran Paradigm Tafsir Al-Quran: Analisis Terhadap Tafsir Feminis Di Indonesia.”
47 Anam, “Peligami Dalam Hermeneutika Feminis Amina Wadud.”
48 Khoiriah, “Poligami Nabi Muhammad Menjadi Alasan Legitimasi Bagi Umatnya Serta Tanggapan Kaum Orientalis.”
Based on the description of the analysis above, Kiai Hafidin’s ideas about everything related to polygamy lead to patriarchal reasoning, both in terms of understanding the verses of the Qur’an and hadith to measuring their relevance in social aspects. The most conspicuous patriarchal reason seen from the repetition of his words regarding the husband is *qawwam* for the wife. The wife is a creature obliged to obey all husband’s orders. Therefore, the egalitarian element cannot be applied to the concept of a happy family from Kiai Hafidin’s perspective because there is a very contrasting gender position inequality between the husband and wife. All prohibitions and orders are only concentrated on the wife’s side, while the husband only owns the authority for free will. The mission of Islam following this situation is to elevate the status of women, fulfill their rights and eliminate all acts of discrimination against women. The patriarchal reasoning constructed in Hafidin’s thoughts has indirectly subordinated women and, at the same time, built the assumption that a man only determines the existence of a family.

**CONCLUSION**

Based on the explanation that has been mentioned, three main things can be concluded from this study. First, the polygamy discourse presented by Kiai Hafidin is still based on the verses of the Qur’an and hadith but with an apologetic model and pattern. The use of the Qur’an and hadith is limited as a form of discursive guidance that ignores the scientific tools of the Qur’an and hadith and has always been attached to the discourse on polygamy. Second, the polygamy discourse presented by Kiai Hafidin in the Robbanian Family Youtube account correlates with the existing social context in Indonesia, namely monogamy discourse. Kiai Hafidin’s polygamous discourse is basically a medium to fight or as a form of resistance to the dominant discourse. In other words, the existence of Kiai Hafidin with his polygamous discourse is a response that then forms a contestation, namely polygamy discourse and monogamy discourse. Third, Kiai Hafidin’s polygamy discourse correlates with the interaction between men and women who have built-in marriage bonds and were extended to socio-religious matters in general. However, when examined further, these three things are basically nothing more than affirming the interests of patriarchy. The entire discourse built by Kiai Hafidin is oriented towards the interests of men without regard to the existence of women.

**REFERENCES**


Aisyah, Siti, Muhammad Irsyad, and Eka Prasetiawati. “Konsep Poligami dalam Al-Qur’an:

---

Family, Robbanian. “3 Motivasi Utama untuk Poligami.” *YouTube*.
———. “5 Pesan untuk Muslimah Yang Ingin Dipoligami.” *YouTube*.
———. “Benarkah Mustahil Adil Jika Berpoligami?” *YouTube*.
———. “Efek Buruk Keluarga Masyarakat Tidak Berpoligami.” *YouTube*.
———. “Inilah Makna Adil dalam Ayat Poligami.” *YouTube*.
———. “Kenapa Harus Bahas Poligami, Emang Ga Ada Sunnah Lain?” *YouTube*.
———. “Layangan Putus vs Kesucian Syariat Poligami.” *YouTube*.
———. “Memilih Calon Istri untuk Poligami.” *YouTube*.
———. “Mengatasi Kekhawatiran Menikah Muda.” *YouTube*.
———. “Para Pejabat Negara Nonton!!! Luar Biasa.. Inilah Diantara Manfaat Poligami.” *YouTube*.
———. “Poligami, Minta Izin atau Minta Maaf?” *YouTube*.
———. “Poligami Bukan Soal Harta.” *YouTube*.
———. “Poligami Juga Syariat, Berislam Kok Tekbang Pilih.” *YouTube*.
———. “Talk Show Bersama Istri 2.” *YouTube*.
Hidayatullah, Haris. “Adil dalam Poligami Perspektif Ibnu Hazm.” *Religi: Jurnal Studi Islam*
Polygamy Mentoring in Indonesia..... (Miski, et.all)


