

# Jamal Al-Banna's Perspective on The Understanding Reconstruction of Changing *Munkar*: Decolonization of the Study of Islamic Thought From Textual to Contextual Knowledge

**Abdul Mufid**

*STAI Khozinatul Ulum Blora, Indonesia*  
[abdulmufid@staikebozin.ac.id](mailto:abdulmufid@staikebozin.ac.id)

## Abstract

Changing *munkar* (doing evil) is one of the crucial and important themes to be discussed, especially when it comes to the religion, it will be even more sensitive. The majority of the Muslim community understands that changing *munkar* by hand is an obligation for the ruler and every individual should not do it as long as there is a ruler. According to Jamal al-Banna, those understanding is to simplify the hadith. This study aims to examine the thoughts of Jamal al-Banna regarding his understanding of change *munkar's* hadith. Then how does understanding the hadith change of *munkar* from Jamal al-Banna's perspective? How is it relevant to the modern era? Those are the research question that will be answered in this study. This research is a literature study with a literature review approach. The results of this study show that there are several points in the results of Jamal al-Banna's understanding of *amar makruf nabi munkar*. First, *amar makruf nabi munkar* is a means legalized by Islam to determine individual participation in the affairs of their society. Second, several verses and hadiths assume that the form of evil that must be changed and even mandatory is the injustice of the ruler. Third, Islam views that *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* from one side is the right of every citizen, but from the other side it is an obligation for one. Fourth, Islam views that the means given legality for *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* are verbal (with good wisdom and advice). However, Islam does not prohibit individuals from exercising their rights, by using their 'hands' when in an emergency and forced situation.

**Keywords:** *Jamal al-Banna, Textual, Contextual, Hadith Interpretation*

## INTRODUCTION

*Nabi munkar* in hadith discourse is always associated with *amar makruf*. Both are one of some basic teachings of Islam that must be carried out by its adherents. *Amar makruf* and *Nabi munkar* is seen as one of the great symbols of Islam and one of the strong joints of rabbinical society. However, the manifestation of these teachings sometimes becomes biased. It is seen from the emergence of several interpretations of the meaning of *amar ma'ruf and nabi munkar* and ways to implement them.<sup>1</sup>

The phenomenon of radical Islam in recent years has caused anxiety among the wider community which is said to have been carried out by some groups from among Muslims in Indonesia. This is often associated with various attitudes of people from radical Islamic

---

<sup>1</sup> Hasan Su'aidi, "Konsep Amar ma'ruf Nahi Munkar Perspektif Hadits," *Jurnal Penelitian* 6, no. 2 (December 2009): 1, <https://doi.org/10.28918/jupe.v6i2.223>.

groups in responding to the wickedness in society which will unconsciously create a stigma of violence in the name of religion.<sup>2</sup> Such as the actions of the declaration of the AKKBB (*Aliansi Kebangkitan untuk Kebebasan Beragama dan Berkeyakinan*) Awakening Alliance for Freedom of Religion and Belief movement, the destruction of immoral places, the terror bombing at two star hotels which were allegedly America's assets, the JW Marriot and Ritz Carlton hotels.

Many factors cause the growth and development of radical movements in the name of religion. One of them, according to Fealy and Hooker, is the result of the massively wide-opening of post-reform democratization. Meanwhile, according to Huntington, the dominant source of today's conflict is not cultural, ideological, or economic. Although the factors for the emergence of religious radicalism are very complex and varied, as stated by John L. Esposito that war and violence in religion always start from the factor of human faith.<sup>3</sup>

There seems to be a contradiction. On the one hand, these people are labeled as radical Islamic groups because their actions are considered anarchic, radical in responding to *munkar*. But on the other hand, the actions of those labeled as radicals are carried out as part of enforcing *nahi munkar* (forbidding wrong action). Moreover, according to scholars, such as Imam Ghazali, al-Alusi, and others, *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* is *fardu kifayah*. Some even consider it a *fardu 'ain* for every Muslim, as Jamal al-Banna argued.

Moreover, as listed from the above phenomenon, the reconstruction of the concepts of *amar ma'ruf* and *nahi munkar* in the perspective of hadith becomes very important. The understanding of hadith changing *munkar* according to Jamal al-Banna's perspective is the focus of this research. Jamal al-Banna becomes the focus on this research because he is an intelligent thinker who always produces and reproduces knowledge.

The research related to *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* has been done by many previous researchers, but no one has done it specifically to reveal the thoughts of Jamal al-Banna. Such as research conducted by La Jamaa (2019),<sup>4</sup> Hasan Sua'di (2009),<sup>5</sup> Jihaddussyufi & Umdatul Hasanah (2019),<sup>6</sup> Ahmad Hidayatullah (2021),<sup>7</sup> Achmad Ainul Yaqin (2018),<sup>8</sup> Indira Cahyaning Firdausi & Muhammad Al Amin (2021),<sup>9</sup> and several other studies. The contribution of this research is to provide a new perspective on the concept of *nahi munkar*

---

<sup>2</sup> La Jamaa, "Persepsi Tokoh Agama Islam Di Kota Ambon Terhadap Amar ma'ruf Nahi Munkar," *Tabkīm* 15, no. 2 (December 2019): 162, <http://dx.doi.org/10.33477/thk.v15i2.1267>.

<sup>3</sup> Dede Rodin, "Islam Dan Radikalisme," *Jurnal Addin* 10 (2016): 26.

<sup>4</sup> Jamaa, "Persepsi Tokoh Agama Islam Di Kota Ambon Terhadap Amar ma'ruf Nahi Munkar."

<sup>5</sup> Su'aidi, "Konsep Amar ma'ruf Nahi Munkar Perspektif Hadits."

<sup>6</sup> Jihaddussyufi and Umdatul Hasanah, "Amar ma'ruf Nahi Munkar Dalam Pandangan Imam al-Ghazali," *Addikra: Jurnal Komunikasi Dan Penyiaran Islam* 10, no. 2 (July 2019), <http://dx.doi.org/10.32678/adzikra.v10i2.4238>.

<sup>7</sup> Achmad Hidayatullah, "Walisongo Da'wah Strategy: Analysis of the Symbolism of Amar ma'ruf Nahi Munkar in Semar and Togog Character," *Munazzama: Journal of Islamic Management and Pilgrimage* 1, no. 1 (July 2019), <https://doi.org/10.1234/mz.v1i1.8789>.

<sup>8</sup> Achmad Ainul Yaqin, "Hadis Amar Makruf Nahi Mungkar Dalam Perspektif Ormas-Ormas Islam Di Jawa Timur" (Thesis, Surabaya, UIN Sunan Ampel, 2018).

<sup>9</sup> Indira Cahyaning Firdausi and Muhammad Al Amin, "Akuntabilitas Pondok Pesantren Dalam Konsep Amar ma'ruf Nahi Munkar," *Borobudur Accounting Review* 1, no. 1 (June 2021): 57–65.

from an Egyptian Muslim thinker who is the younger brother of Hasan al-Banna, the founder of Ikhwanul Muslimin (Muslim Brotherhood Association).

## METHODOLOGY

This research basically tries to explore Jamal al-Banna's view on the concept of *nabi munkar* through his work Tafsir Hadith *Man Ra'a Minkum Munkaran fal Yughayyirhu* (1988) which is then used as a reference as primary sources in this research. Therefore, this type of study is a library research with a literature review approach. In addition to getting a complete understanding of the research theme which is also related to past facts or practices, of course this research is also closely related to the social conditions that developed at that time by examining some of the historical literature on the emergence of hadith (*asbabul wurud*) which explains about *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar*.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

### Significance and Indications of *Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar*

#### *Amar ma'ruf Nahi munkar in Islam*

Etymologically, *amar ma'ruf* is an order or direction for goodness.<sup>10</sup> Meanwhile, the purpose of *nabi munkar* is to prevent or restrain *munkar*. According to the consensus of scholars, *nabi munkar* is obligatory or *fardu kifayah*. They argue that *nabi munkar* is not only reserved for those in power, but is a stipulation for every Muslim individual.<sup>11</sup>

Meanwhile, in terms of terminology, *ma'ruf* is all goodness known to the human soul and makes his heart at peace, while *munkar* is the opposite of *ma'ruf*, namely disobedience. An evil act is an act that commands disobedience. *Amar* is a demand for actions from a higher position to a lower position. Furthermore, the word *ma'ruf* has the meaning of knowing. When it changes to isim *maf'ul*, it literally means famous. *Nabi* according to language is prohibition, according to the term is a word used to leave an action, while according to *usul fiqh* is a word that tells us to leave a job that is ordered by someone who is higher than us.<sup>12</sup>

*Amar ma'ruf* and *Nabi munkar* only as an effort, so it is a command of Allah which is only limited to an effort to eliminate evil, not the loss of evil. Because the loss of evil is the prerogative of Allah. As stated in QS. Ali Imran verse 104. Therefore, the phenomenon that occurs in society that *amar ma'ruf* must succeed and evil must be totally eliminated is a wrong perspective.<sup>13</sup>

Salman bin Fahd al-Audah in his book *Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar*, reveals that the means of enjoining *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* are not limited to one particular form. However, it must meet two requirements, namely: First, it includes something that is *mubah* (permissible). A perpetrator or enforcer of *Nabi munkar* is not allowed to use unlawful means to change a *munkar*. Second, it can lead to the goal, in which the *munkar* can disappear and

---

<sup>10</sup> Ahsin W. Al-Hafidz, "Kamus Ilmu Al-Qur'an," in *Kamus Ilmu Al-Qur'an* (Jakarta: Amzah, 2008), 22.

<sup>11</sup> Al-Hafidz, 216.

<sup>12</sup> A. Ahyar Aminudin, *Ushul Fiqih II* (Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 1998), 107.

<sup>13</sup> Muh Gufron Hidayatullah, "Konsep 'Amar Makruf Nahi Mungkar Dalam Al-Qur'an Perspektif Mufassirin Dan Fuqaha'," *Al'Adalah* 23, no. 1 (April 2020): 3, <https://doi.org/10.35719/aladalah.v23i1.55>.

change or turn into *ma'rufan*. Based on this, if the means do not come with the benefits, then it does not need to be used.<sup>14</sup>

### ***Amar ma'ruf Nahi munkar in the Perspective of the Qur'an and Hadith***

The term *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* in the Qur'an is mentioned nine times in different surahs, the sentences are written simultaneously. While the word *ma'ruf*, there are 39 times mentioned in different surahs. This shows that the teaching of *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* is very important to be enforced and implemented in Islam, so that it gets considerable attention among scholars and Muslim leaders.<sup>15</sup>

According to Fu'ad Abdul Baqi as quoted by Abdul Karim Sheikh, in the Qur'an found 71 times the word *ma'ruf* with all its derivation words, and the word *munkar* with various forms of its derivation found 37 times. These words, which are defined as *amar ma'ruf* and *nahi munkar*, are found eight times in several letters and verses, which in Islamic society are known and are already quite popular with the term *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*.<sup>16</sup>

Meanwhile, according to Hasan Sua'idi (2009) in his research, he stated that the hadith of *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* was found in 6 books of hadith, namely Sahih Muslim, Sunan Abu Daud, Sunan at-Tirmizi, Sunan an-Nasa'i, Sunan Ibn Majh, and Musnad Ahmad bin Hanbal. The total number of sanad reaches 22 narrators. Each narrator has a connection. Because each of the narrators has a teacher-student relationship. In addition, these narrators are also considered as *siqah* narrators. So it can be concluded that the *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* hadith chain is a valid sanad because it meets the criteria for the validity of the hadith sanad.<sup>17</sup>

According to Moh. Ali Aziz, the term *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* is close to *da'wah*. The implementation of *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* in his view is the obligation of every Muslim and becomes the identity of the believer.<sup>18</sup> In Imam al-Ghazali's view, people who do not want to carry out the task of enforcing *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* are considered sinful, even threatened with curses and torments from the world to the hereafter.<sup>19</sup>

According to Jamal al-Banna, there are many signs in the Qur'an to invite good and prevent evil. These signs use the word *al-ma'ruf wa al-munkar* and other use the derivation of both. However, in order to understand the meaning of the Qur'an regarding *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*, it is necessary to explore all these words.<sup>20</sup>

Regarding to *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* which is the topic of this study, it can be seen in QS. Ali Imran: 104, 110, 114, QS. At-Taubah: 71, 112, QS. Al-Haj: 41, and QS. Luqman: 17. Meanwhile the word *al-ma'ruf* appears in many other verses with meanings other than the meaning of *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*, as in several verses as follows: QS. Al-Baqarah: 178, 180,

---

<sup>14</sup> Salman bin Fahd al-Audah, *Amar ma'ruf Nahi Munkar* (Jakarta: Pustaka Al-Kautsar, 1993), 60.

<sup>15</sup> Badarussyamsi, M. Ridwan, and Nur Aiman, "Amar ma'ruf Nahi Munkar," *Tajdid* 19, no. 2 (July 2020): 272–73, <https://doi.org/10.30631/tjd.v19i2.175>.

<sup>16</sup> Abdul Karim Syeikh, "Rekonstruksi Makna Dan Metode Penerapan Amar ma'ruf Nahi Munkar Berdasarkan Al-Qur'an," *Al-Idarah: Jurnal Manajemen Dan Administrasi Islam* 2, no. 2 (July 2018): 3, <http://dx.doi.org/10.22373/al-idarah.v2i2.4009>.

<sup>17</sup> Su'aidi, "Konsep Amar ma'ruf Nahi Munkar Perspektif Hadits," 4–5.

<sup>18</sup> Moh. Ali Aziz, *Ilmu Dakwah* (Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group, 2009), 38.

<sup>19</sup> Abu Hamid al-Ghazali, *Ihya' Ulum Ad-Din* (Semarang: Thoha Putra, n.d.), 303.

<sup>20</sup> Jamal al-Banna, *Tafsir Hadis Man Ra'a Minkum Munkaran Fal Yughayyirhu*, n.d., 24, [www.kotobarabia.com](http://www.kotobarabia.com).

228, 229, 231, 232, 234, 236, 263, QS. An-Nisa': 5, 19, 25, 114, QS. Muhammad: 21, QS. Al-Mumtahanah: 12, and QS. Ath-Thalaq: 6. Sometimes used with the word *ma'rufan*, as in the QS. Al-Baqarah: 235, QS. An-Nisa': 5, QS. Luqman: 15, and QS. Al-Ahzab: 32.

What is clear is that Qur'an, whether it uses the words *bi al-ma'ruf* or *ma'rufan* in some of the verses described above, shows the meaning of tolerance, kindness, good character, and noble in interaction, and away from evil and stinginess. Therefore, most of the topics used by Qur'an show the relationship between interacting with women, although the specificity of this use does not at all affect to the meaning of Qur'an to the word *al-ma'ruf*.

Qur'an usually combines *nabi munkar* with *amar ma'ruf* as the verses stated above, but that happens in cases where Qur'an talks about *nabi munkar* only. As it is also known that the Qur'an and hadith emphasize *nabi munkar* in many places rather than admonishing *ma'ruf*. Among the verses that only mention *nabi munkar* without being accompanied by *amar ma'ruf* as in the QS. Al-Ma'idah: 63, 79, QS. Al-A'raf: 165, QS. An-Nahl: 90, and QS. Hud: 116. Among the derivations of the word *al-munkar* which is used in the Qur'an and is at the point of being very *munkar* as in the QS. Al-Kahf: 74, 87, and QS. At-Thalaq: 8.<sup>21</sup>

### ***Meaning of the verse globally:***

The above verses explain that *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* is included in *fardu mu'akkad* for Muslims, and includes the essence of the prophetic mission, as stated in the Qur'an QS. Al-A'raf: 157. The Qur'an pairs *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* with faith in Allah, establish prayers, and pay zakat shows a way for Muhammad's people become the best human. Sometimes Qur'an uses *al-ma'ruf* editorial to show that there is a mandatory bond in the relationship between men and women, especially when they are married, they will find conflict or divorce. There more concern in the matter of *nabi munkar* than *amar ma'ruf*. Qur'an considers that one of the reasons for the destruction of the Children of Israel and the others because they did not prevent each other from doing the evil deeds. The Qur'an praises the actions of those who give advice to their people even after the truth of the advice appears. Because they have a reason to escape responsibility, as indicated in the QS. Al-A'raf: 164.<sup>22</sup>

According to Jamal al-Banna, there are 21 traditions that implicitly mention *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar*, such as the hadith compiled by Imam Muslim in his *Sahih* from the narration of Abu Sa'id al-Khudri, and there are 10 hadiths that explicitly point to *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar*, like on hadith said that *religious is advice*.<sup>23</sup>

### ***The global meaning of hadith:***

Several hadiths describe *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* as an inseparable part of the structure of Islamic society such as an image of a ship. Several hadiths give a strong warning of the coming of Allah's punishment when the Muslims neglect this obligation. Similar hadiths explain that the most terrible *munkar* is in the form of tyranny, the best of jihad is the *haq*

---

<sup>21</sup> Al-Banna, *Tafsir Hadis Man Ra'a Minkum Munkaran Fal Yughayyirhu*, 32.

<sup>22</sup> Al-Banna, 33.

<sup>23</sup> Al-Banna, *Tafsir Hadis Man Ra'a Minkum Munkaran Fal Yughayyirhu*, 34–35.

(right) sentence in the presence of an ruthless leader, and the master of the martyrs is Hamzah bin Abdul Muttalib.

Many hadiths warn that fear causes one not to tell the truth, although other traditions recommend denying (oppose) immoral rulers and boycotting them, not approaching them and distrusting them. These traditions view that this is a sufficient way to change an evil.

These hadiths contain *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* even though these two sentences are not specifically mentioned such as popular hadith, *religion is advice*, for everyone, both priests and common people. Because advice is a comprehensive word so that it can cover every good commandment and forbid what is wrong, and the word of advice itself is addressed to everyone. Some hadiths prohibit one from underestimate something good, and stipulate that among the good deeds are removing dangers on the road, and to meet your brother with a cheerful face.

### **The similarities of *amar ma'ruf Nahi munkar* in the Qur'an and Hadith**

There are several similarities between the focus points of the *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* between the Qur'an and the hadith; 1) The verses and hadiths agree on the need and importance of *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*, and it is an integral part of the nature and entity of Islamic society; 2) The verses and hadith agree to pay attention to *nahi munkar* more than attention to *amar ma'ruf*; 3) The verses and hadiths agree in stating that ignoring *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* is one of the biggest causes of the decline and destruction of the society, and is entitled to a threat from God; 4) The verses and hadiths agree that the context shows which what is desired from *nahi munkar* is to oppose general deviation, system failure, failure of rulers, and their oppression. There is nothing in the verses and hadiths that indicate that what is meant is individual special cases; 5) The hadiths specifically show that confronting an oppressive and ruthless ruler, whether commanded or forbidden, is the highest level of jihad. And that whoever is killed for it will be like Hamza, the master of the martyrs; 6) The verses talk about *al-ma'ruf* as an obligatory characteristic of the relationship between man and woman, husband and wife, especially when there is conflict or divorce. While the hadith provides an example of *al-ma'ruf* by eliminating the dangers on the road and facing other people with a cheerful face; 7) Several hadiths and verses with the theme of *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*, there is only one hadith which expressly implies changing *munkar* by hand (strength), whereas other traditions and verses oblige *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* in form of wisdom, good advice, or boycott. Even though it is the only sign to change *munkar* by hand (force), but not by various means of violence, such as destruction, devastation, and so on.

### **The Understanding Method of Jamal al-Banna Hadith**

There are two trends regarding to the study of hadith so far. First, conservative tendencies. This tendency is usually followed by fiqh scholars and protected by religious institutions such as al-Azhar, the Waqf Institute (in Egypt), and so on. Second, the tendency to separate hadith

from the Qur'an. According to this second school, the Qur'an is entirety and does not need hadith, except for the sunnah '*amali*' whose narration reaches the mutawatir level.<sup>24</sup>

Jamal al-Banna disagrees with the two above tendencies. As for the criticism of the first stream, Jamal believes that the concept of the sanad cannot guarantee in an effort to save the hadith because the falsification of the hadith has been developing for approximately 100 years before the *tadwin al-hadith* (hadith codification) period. Even the falsification of the hadith was carried out at the time of the Prophet by the Jews and the hypocrites.

To be able to understand the hadith "*Whoever among you sees an evil, then let him change it with his hand (his power); if he is not able, then with his tongue (advising him); and if he is not able too, then with his heart (feeling disapproving and disapproving), and so that is the weakest faith,*" then one must master the study of hadith. Because understanding the hadith is not explaining its foreign sentences or ambiguous meanings. There are many hadiths whose editorials are easy to understand, but still require explanation, one of which is the hadith that is the theme of this study. But the interpretation of the hadith, which in fact is the second source of law after Qur'an, demands more explanation of the words and meanings.

The problem is even deeper. In Islamic treasures there is the term *subut*, which means ensuring the validity of hadith by tracing a series of lines of narration from the early narrators (companions) to the collectors of hadith. Discussion about it is obtained in the science of *mustalah* hadith. Also that must be considered is the practice of *takbrij* hadith.<sup>25</sup>

Surprisingly, in the matters of general and major nature, the jurists (*fukaha*) still adhere to traditions whose credibility is still contested. Like the hadith of Mu'adz bin Jabal when ordered by the Prophet to go to Yemen. This hadith was narrated by at-Tirmidhi, Abu Daud, and ad-Darimi. According to al-Albani in the *Mishkah al-Masabih*, this hadith has a weak *isnad*, even though it is used as evidence (*hujah*) by the scholars in the field of fiqh proposals. There are also many hadith scholars who consider the Mu'adz hadith weak, such as al-Bukhari, at-Tirmidhi, ad-Daruquthni, Abdul Haq al-Isybili, Ibn al-Jauzi, al-Iraqi, and other scholars.<sup>26</sup>

### **Jamal al-Banna's Interpretation of *Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar***

According to Jamal, the greatest principle and has become the stipulation of syara' in *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* is wisdom and good advice. However, in some cases, this wisdom and good advice does not oppose the means of force and coercion. Therefore, the hand (strength) needs to be present in the matter of *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*, but its existence is regulated by special conditions and is not a basic stipulation from the shari'a.<sup>27</sup>

The *kehalaf fiqh* scholars and contemporary hadith scholars do not understand such hadiths. Maybe they have difficulty finding the legal context of the hadith that mentions the word hand (strength). But what is clear, that the mention at the beginning does not mean to indicate the most important way. However, every hadith must be interpreted within a

---

<sup>24</sup> Mukhammad Zamzami, "Metodologi Studi Hadis Jamal Al-Banna," *Mutawatir: Jurnal Keilmuan Tafsir Hadis* 4, no. 2 (December 2014): 229.

<sup>25</sup> Al-Banna, *Tafsir Hadis Man Ra'a Minkum Munkaran Fal Yughayyirhu*, 51.

<sup>26</sup> Al-Banna, *Tafsir Hadis Man Ra'a Minkum Munkaran Fal Yughayyirhu*, 53.

<sup>27</sup> Al-Banna, 90.

universal framework of the sunnah, so that it can interact with other traditions, complement each other between sunnah and hadith, not contradict each other.<sup>28</sup>

So, according to Jamal, there is still space to use it by hand (the way of strength) as the text of the hadith texts, but it is different from the interpretation made by most of the commentators and hadith experts who exemplify the form of *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* by destroying jars of intoxicating drinks, destroying game tools, and so on. That is an example of Islamist groups who practiced the hadith *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* in one of their expansions in Germany when they attacked Laurie who was carrying a beer bottle and one of the video CDs. That is not the method taught by the Prophet or the Companions.<sup>29</sup>

Therefore, the field of denying *munkar* by hand can be applied according to the existing situation, conditions, and *munkar*. For example, if a man abuses a woman, is it logical for that person to only be given good advice? Or pickpocketing motorists and pedestrians is only given good advice? Shouldn't it be better to catch him and imprison him? Is it logical that we only give good advice when we see a mighty man hitting a poor woman or a small child with a stinging blow, shouldn't that person just be thrown? In another case, for example, when we saw someone who tried to commit suicide trying to jump into the river, shouldn't he have pulled it off immediately?<sup>30</sup>

Mentioned in one hadith, and this hadith is the reference for Jamal al-Banna, the Prophet said: "Help your brother who is doing wrong or who is being persecuted." According to Jamal, the purpose of *helping your brother who is doing wrong* is that you prevent him from being wrong. And preventing injustice against others is a field that often requires the use of hands. For example, workers who try to stop their employers from doing injustice, so they go on strike or boycott the shift schedule. Then this also includes *nabi munkar* through the hands connotatively. There is another hadith that opens up the field of *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* with the hands, when talking about eliminating distractions on the road and eliminating *najis* (unclean) in mosques. Eliminating both is considered to prevent evil and is part of the faith.<sup>31</sup>

And with such an understanding of the hadith, every obstacle, disturbance, and some bad phenomena that occur on the road and various means of transportation is an evil which whoever removes it by hand (in connotation), will get a reward. In contrast to those who interpret the hand as destruction under the pretext of *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar*.

There are other fields where *nabi munkar* by hand is interpreted as a denotative meaning because there is an element of power. Like a father's command to his son to pray at a certain age and beat him if he doesn't want to pray at a certain age. But the use of the hand in denotation in the field of *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* is limited.<sup>32</sup>

In some of the examples above, the proper *nabi munkar* is to use the hands (both connotatively and denotatively). But in another example, the means prescribed by the Shari'a

---

<sup>28</sup> Al-Banna, 91.

<sup>29</sup> Al-Banna, 91.

<sup>30</sup> Al-Banna, 91–92.

<sup>31</sup> Al-Banna, 92.

<sup>32</sup> Al-Banna, *Tafsir Hadis Man Ra'a Minkum Munkaran Fal Yughayyirhu*, 93.



are verbal. Because the conditions that require doing *nahi munkar* are different. Sometimes situations require dealing with it emotionally, and sometimes persuasively.

Many scholars do not understand the concept of refusing with the heart (*nahi munkar* with the heart). According to Jamal, the intention of *nahi munkar* with the heart is to boycott all evil ways as much as possible. If the *munkar* is in the form of injustice from the ruler so that circumstances prevent him from denying it by hand or verbally, then it is not permissible to cooperate with or support that ruler. Therefore, disobeying with the heart leads to negative behavior which is very important when traditional situations call for positive behavior. This is very denial by heart. If not, then there is no denial with the heart essentially.

The boycotting movement is one of the forms of *Nahi munkar* accepted by Islam, where it is no longer possible to carry out resistance by hand or verbally. There are many hadiths that support this statement. And perhaps the boycott will have a serious effect which is not seen when reading the hadith (*bence with his heart. And that is the weakest of faith*), because even the weakest faith can be stronger and greater than military power and wealth.

### **Important Signs Before Applying *Amar ma'ruf Nahi munkar* Hadith**

As explained above that the correct interpretation of a hadith must be carried out within the framework of the overall content of the sunnah, as well as within the directives of the Qur'an and the general objectives of the Shari'ah. And whoever precedes a hadith, he will only go before the lion and enter the wilderness. So if he has no knowledge of how to deal with lions, or experience on desert roads, he will perish.

This should come as no surprise, because the hadiths are not entertainment, but rather texts that justify what is lawful and forbid what is unlawful, command and forbid. In the sense that the hadith is the highest level in the legal ranks, and no one is called to process a legal text unless he has been familiar with a certain legal culture for several years.

At first glance it may seem that there is nothing easier than the hadith that is the theme of the study, but before and after its application, it can lead us to valleys, rocks, hills, and highlands that are impossible to understand and know the distance apart except by passing through them. All this is called the sunnah.

*Amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* is part of the sunnah, which of course cannot understand the part except to explore the point. Because in the subject there is a matter that relates to the part, or controls it, or directs this part. If this is not known, then the understanding of the hadith will not be complete and its application will not be good, in fact it can bring about *munkar* that is worse than the evil twchich is forbidden by the hadith.

The following are practical steps that need to be considered before applying *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*. Following this method of interpretation, can reveal new aspects in the problem of *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*.

### ***Start with yourself***

*Amar ma'ruf* and *nahi munkar* are virtues and rights that must be fulfilled by everyone. It can be understood implicitly that the subject who does it is someone else to whom he is directed to *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*, but at the same time, it means that he is *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*

to himself. Set an example for yourself to do good, and forbid evil, as well as oblige that behavior to others. Thus it is a logical sequence, in addition to the many texts (Qur'an and hadith) that require severe punishment for those who command goodness (*amar ma'ruf*), but he himself does not do the good. Also forbids doing evil, but he did it.

Therefore, if the *amar ma'ruf* and *nabi munkar* are intended as a means to perfect the shortcomings and correct the deviations of others, then it also means as a means to reform the soul and control it in the rhythm of *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar*. And whoever does not do that, then the *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* that he does will not bring reward, even bring punishment. As quipped in the Qur'an, Surah al-Baqarah verse 44, Surah Ali Imran verse 92, and Surah Ash-Shaf verse 2-3.

It was narrated from Usamah bin Zaid, that the Prophet said: "On the Day of Resurrection a person will be presented who will then be thrown into the hell, his stomach comes out and fall apart until he spins around like a donkey spinning around pulling its milling machine. Then the people of Hell gathered around him saying: "O polan, what happened to you? Weren't you the one who ordered us to do good and forbid us to do *munkar*?" The man said: "I did order you to do *ma'ruf* but I did not do it and forbade you to do *munkar*, but instead I did it." (Narrated by Al-Bukhari, hadith number 3027).

Then from Abu Dzar in a long hadith, that the Prophet SAW once said to him: "Say the truth even though the truth is bitter." Abu Dzar said: Add another will (testament), O Prophet. He replied: Do not be afraid of reproach when preaching in the way of Allah. Abu Dzar said again: Add another will (testament), O Prophet. He said: "In order to keep you away from others unless you know within yourself."

From Anas, the Messenger of Allah said: "On the night I was being traveled, I saw a group of people whose mouths were cut with scissors from hell. I then asked: "Who are they, O Jibril?" Jibril replied: They are preachers from your Ummah who command people to do good while they forget themselves. It is narrated in *Sharh as-Sunnah*, and al-Baihaqi in *Shu'ab al-Iman*: "The preachers of your ummah, they call for good but do not do it. They also often read the Qur'an, but do not understand it."

Based on the explanation above, anyone who uses the meaning of *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* like that, then he will be busy and do not have time to correct the mistakes of others, and he will not miss a single good. In a hadith it is stated: "Blessed is the person who is so busy with his disgrace that he does not pay attention to the faults of others." And if everyone did that, then everyone would treat themselves and try to fix it. That is the goal of education which the latest system cannot achieve. Therefore, if he imagines himself to be *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar*, then his attention to improve himself will be proportional to his ambition to *amar ma'ruf* and *nabi munkar*.

Sometimes it could be that the actions of *amar ma'ruf nabi munkar* that are carried out are not solely for the sake of Allah, but contain some of the inner and soul satisfaction, and that is the result of a human's sense of arrogance towards others, believing that he is more noble than others.

### ***Ujub is worse than the ordinary sins***

This is the other side that usually afflicts people who are *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*. Sometimes a person who invites kindness for the first time really intends purely for the sake of Allah, but not a few are infected with a sense of *ujub* in the middle. But *ujub* cannot reach a preacher for the following reasons: Among these is something he may see of ignorance, poverty, and misery in the people he is talking to; 1) Verify that a crime has actually occurred; 2) Ensure that the crime that must be changed is strictly prohibited; 3) The prohibition of evil should not lead to another, greater crime; 4) Covering disgrace is a noble act, as is carrying out an order.

### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the description above, it can be concluded that the results of Jamal al-Banna's thoughts on *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar*, that Muslims really need *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* in order to fight the forces of deviation, crime, and selfishness that reject the progress of the people. *Amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* can be carried out properly if it is understood correctly on all the pillars and supports. The pillars and supports for the *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* referred to by Jamal can be described in the following points: First, *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* is a means given legality by Islam to determine individual participation in the affairs of their society. Second, several verses and hadiths assume that the form of evil that must be changed and even mandatory is the injustice of the ruler. Third, Islam views that *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* from one side is the right of every citizen, but from the other side it is an obligation for him. Fourth, Islam views that the means given legality for *amar ma'ruf nahi munkar* are verbal (with wisdom and good advice). However, Islam does not prohibit individuals from their rights, such as using their hands when in an emergency and forced.

### **REFERENCES**

- Al-Hafidz, Ahsin W. "Kamus Ilmu Al-Qur'an." In *Kamus Ilmu Al-Qur'an*, 22. Jakarta: Amzah, 2008.
- Aminudin, A. Ahyar. *Ushul Fiqih II*. Bandung: Pustaka Setia, 1998.
- Audah, Salman bin Fahd al-. *Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar*. Jakarta: Pustaka Al-Kautsar, 1993.
- Aziz, Moh. Ali. *Ilmu Dakwah*. Jakarta: Kencana Prenada Media Group, 2009.
- Badarussyamsi, M. Ridwan, and Nur Aiman. "Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar." *Tajdid* 19, no. 2 (July 2020): 272–73. <https://doi.org/10.30631/tjd.v19i2.175>.
- Banna, Jamal al-. *Tafsir Hadis Man Ra'a Minkum Munkaran Fal Yughayyirhu*, n.d. [www.kotobarabia.com](http://www.kotobarabia.com).
- Firdausi, Indira Cahyaning, and Muhammad Al Amin. "Akuntabilitas Pondok Pesantren Dalam Konsep Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar." *Borobudur Accounting Review* 1, no. 1 (June 2021): 57–65.
- Ghazali, Abu Hamid al-. *Ihya' Ulum Ad-Din*. Semarang: Thoha Putra, n.d.
- Hidayatullah, Achmad. "Walisongo Da'wah Strategy: Analysis of the Symbolism of Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar in Semar and Togog Character." *Munazzama: Journal of Islamic Management and Pilgrimage* 1, no. 1 (July 2019). <https://doi.org/10.1234/mz.v1i1.8789>.

- Hidayatullah, Muh Gufron. "Konsep 'Amar Makruf Nahi Mungkar Dalam Al-Qur'an Perspektif Mufassirin Dan Fuqaha'." *Al'Adalah* 23, no. 1 (April 2020): 3. <https://doi.org/10.35719/aladalah.v23i1.55>.
- Jamaa, La. "Persepsi Tokoh Agama Islam Di Kota Ambon Terhadap Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar." *Tabkim* 15, no. 2 (December 2019): 162. <http://dx.doi.org/10.33477/thk.v15i2.1267>.
- Jihaddussyufi, and Umdatul Hasanah. "Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar Dalam Pandangan Imam al-Ghazali." *Addikra: Jurnal Komunikasi Dan Penyiaran Islam* 10, no. 2 (July 2019). <http://dx.doi.org/10.32678/adzikra.v10i2.4238>.
- Rodin, Dede. "Islam Dan Radikalisme." *Jurnal Addin* 10 (2016): 26.
- Su'aidi, Hasan. "Konsep Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar Perspektif Hadits." *Jurnal Penelitian* 6, no. 2 (December 2009): 1. <https://doi.org/10.28918/jupe.v6i2.223>.
- Syeikh, Abdul Karim. "Rekonstruksi Makna Dan Metode Penerapan Amar Ma'ruf Nahi Munkar Berdasarkan Al-Qur'an." *Al-Idarah: Jurnal Manajemen Dan Administrasi Islam* 2, no. 2 (July 2018): 3. <http://dx.doi.org/10.22373/al-idarah.v2i2.4009>.
- Yaqin, Achmad Ainul. "Hadis Amar Makruf Nahi Mungkar Dalam Perspektif Ormas-Ormas Islam Di Jawa Timur." Thesis, UIN Sunan Ampel, 2018.
- Zamzami, Mukhammad. "Metodologi Studi Hadis Jamal Al-Banna." *Mutawatir: Jurnal Keilmuan Tafsir Hadis* 4, no. 2 (December 2014): 229.